

December 9, 2015

Governor Jerry Brown  
Sacramento, CA

We, the undersigned organizations and individuals, demand the Governor's and the Legislature's immediate attention to the use of government computers and email systems within the Department of Toxic Substances Control (DTSC) to transmit overtly racist emails, specifically targeting Asians, Latinos, and African Americans. As we understand the facts, these emails were found on State computers, sent during working hours, while staff were purported to be conducting state business. After countless meetings and hearings with DTSC, our organizations have lost faith in the governmental agency tasked with protecting our most vulnerable residents from toxic hazards, residents who predominantly are Asian, Latino, and African American.

As organizations that work directly with the Department and the residents it is tasked with protecting, it pains us to see what it has become—an agency steeped in implicit and explicit racial bias. Since discovering the racist emails, it pains us further still that DTSC has worked harder to cover it up than correct it. After years of mismanagement, we can no longer simply stand by and wait for the agency to fix itself. For that reason, we are calling on you, Governor Brown, and on Legislative leadership to step in and oversee a process to root out racial bias within California agencies, using DTSC as the benchmark for establishing a sound and transparent process to identify, disclose, and address inappropriate prejudice in state employees.

### **Racism within the ranks**

It is our understanding that during a DTSC review of documents in fulfilling a Public Records Act (PRA) request for CCAEJ on behalf of residents impacted by toxic exposures, staff came across emails of a very racist nature – jokes, cartoons, comments, and derogatory remarks against Asians, Latinos and African Americans. Phrases such as “crackho hooker”, “chop-chop Hop Sing” and “Mommy must have had way too many pain killers when she named this guy” are in the emails. These were found on state computers, sent during state time while conducting state business. The staff fulfilling the PRA disclosed the emails to Director Barbara Lee, who brought in Human Resources and treated it as an

individual personnel issue. We are disappointed that she chose to handle the situation as a personnel issue – thereby sealing what should be public records from outside review.

After waiting a month, staff determined that they did not need to disclose the emails as part of the PRA and have kept them from public scrutiny ever since. While the emails should have been produced as part of the PRA request, DTSC withheld them. DTSC also did not disclose their existence, or a reason for withholding the responsive emails as requested and as required by state law.

Despite numerous attempts to gain access to the emails, DTSC has refused to acknowledge or release them to the public or disclose their full contents. This matter was brought to the attention of the Attorney General's office as well as staff at CalEPA with no response. In speaking with a staffer from the Governor's office, the response was "Barbara has taken care of that... I think she fired him." But to our knowledge, the staff members continue to work at DTSC; their cases have not been examined for bias nor have any steps been taken to ensure other staff members have not acted with inappropriate racial bias.

When the governor's staffer was pressed that this is indicative of a larger racist culture in the agency, the response was, "They're [agencies] all like that." The off handed way in which this incidence is being treated is exactly the way the concerns and well-being of the affected communities are being treated by DTSC staff. For people within government to know this, and to participate in that culture by simply dismissing such egregious activity is even more appalling.

If DTSC staff members feel comfortable enough to use their state issued computer to send overtly racist emails, racial insensitivity and bias must be embedded within the very culture of DTSC. DTSC works closely with communities of color throughout the state. In fact, hazardous waste facilities are overwhelmingly located in poorer, predominantly non-white communities. Over 80 percent of residents living near a hazardous waste facility in California are non-white, the largest percentage of any state in the U.S.

Toxic cleanup sites similarly are concentrated in primarily non-white communities that do not have the money to hire well-heeled lobbyists to defend their interests or to make generous contributions to state politicians. Therefore, the prevalence of racist beliefs, attitudes and opinions greatly compromises the agency's ability

to do its job and reduce the threat of toxic exposure to those most impacted — Asians, Latinos, and African-Americans.

By refusing to disclose and address the racially prejudicial beliefs of some of its employees, DTSC also further erodes the public's confidence in an agency already reeling from widespread disapproval. Communities have repeatedly expressed alarm and dismay at the way DTSC staff callously disregards their concerns, dismissing their complaints, and treats them disrespectfully. Since racial bias can influence the assumptions, judgments and decisions in the day-to-day work of DTSC, if staff believe that "some people" are inherently less worthy of protection, these beliefs may influence the level of clean up, level of attention, and level of respect certain communities get from DTSC.

The City of San Francisco faced a similar situation when it discovered text messages sent by one of their police officers that were overtly racist and homophobic in nature. In response, the City opened up the process, disclosed the offended texts, and provided transparent opportunities for the public to review and comment on the information disclosed. In the investigation they discovered other officers that had also been involved in sending such messages. The City reviewed every case that each officer had been involved in to ensure their attitudes and beliefs did not affect their decision making. The City of San Francisco stepped up and cleaned house in an open and transparent process, thus restoring a level of public trust in the department.

We demand that the State conduct an open and transparent investigation to determine which staff are involved, as well as the extent to which implicit or explicit bias has tainted the agency's decisions. The different approaches taken by the City of San Francisco and DTSC in the face of staff bias reveals complacency at DTSC that undermines its responsibility to communities of color in California. San Francisco recognized the widespread harm stemming from even a single officer's bias towards certain classes he must serve and protect. Whereas at DTSC, the agency believes that the racially derogatory emails are simply the result of bad judgment and poor taste, without any recognition that bias can and does impact decision-making in the treatment of communities this agency is tasked by law to protect. In addition to the recent discovery of racist emails, our organizations are aware of at least three discrimination complaints filed within the agency. We understand that DTSC has already moved one complainant from

its headquarters to a regional office in what could be viewed as a retaliatory response.

We are concerned that thousands of families across this state may be in harm's way or forced to live in dangerous situations due in part to the racist attitudes, judgment and actions of DTSC staff. If staff are influenced by a belief that there are some people more worth fighting for than others, the reforms needed at the Departments go much further and deeper than we previously anticipated. It is clear to us that the Governor and the Legislature must now step in to reform the agency or close it down.

**We request that the Governor and Legislative leadership ensure that the following measures be taken to address the racist environment within DTSC:**

- 1. Release all racist emails to the public and conduct a full, open, and transparent investigation into them;**
- 2. Review all emails within the department to identify any other inappropriate and unacceptable communications and take appropriate action;**
- 3. Review all cases such identified employees have participated in to determine if their racial beliefs and attitudes have impacted decisions at these sites.**
- 4. Establish a zero tolerance policy for racist or otherwise prejudicial statements, attitudes or behavior;**
- 5. Analyze and disclose staff demographics at DTSC and implement a diversity outreach and hiring program.**
- 6. Hold a Senate Rules Committee hearing on this matter using subpoena power, and provide recommendations to the Governor for implementation.**
- 7. Address this issue through the newly created Independent Review Panel.**

**With deep concern,**

**Penny J. Newman, Executive Director  
Center for Community Action and Environmental Justice (CCA EJ)  
Riverside/San Bernardino, CA**

Ingrid Brostrom  
People's Senate

Strela Cervas  
California Environmental Justice Alliance

Bradley Angel  
Greenaction for Health and Environmental Justice

Sarah Rose, CEO  
California League of Conservation Voters (CLCV)

Denise Duffield  
Physicians for Social Responsibility - LA  
Los Angeles, CA

Jessica Tovar  
Urban and Environmental Policy Institute  
Occidental College

Floyd and Xonia Villeneuve  
Concerned Neighbors of Wildomar  
Wildomar, CA

Ester Rojo, and Jaime Sanchez  
Neighbors Against Phibro Tech  
Santa Fe Springs, CA

Caroline Farrell, Executive Director  
Center on Race, Poverty & the Environment (CRPE)  
Delano, CA.

Diane Takvorian  
Environmental Health Coalition (EHC)  
San Diego, CA

Antonio Diaz  
People Organized to Demand Economic and Environmental Rights (PODER)  
San Francisco, CA

mark! Lopez  
East Yard Communities for Environmental Justice  
Commerce, CA 90040

Erin Runions / Ingrid Gutierrez  
United Voices of Pomona for Environmental Justice,  
Pomona CA

Preston Bowling, Founder  
Aerospace Contamination Museum of Education (ACME)  
Topanga Canyon, CA

Lisa Lappin  
Carlton Forge  
Paramount ca

Maria Castro / Orlando Recinos  
AgPark Family  
Riverside, Ca.

Tom Dolan  
Executive Director  
Inland Congregations United for Change (ICUC)  
Riverside/San Bernardino

Bronwyn Leebaw  
Associate Professor Political Science  
University of California at Riverside, CA

Matt Abularach-Macias  
Inland Region Equality Network (IREN)  
Riverside/San Bernardino

Wafaa Aborashed, Executive Director  
Bay Area Healthy880 Communities

Teri Johnson  
Children For A Safe Environment

Roberta Camacho-Treasurer  
Asamblea de Gonzales  
Gonzales CA

Ruthie Sakheim, Coordinator  
OccupyForum and OccupySF Environmental Justice Working Group  
San Francisco, California

Piya Chatterjee  
Professor, Department of Feminist Gender and Sexuality Studies  
Scripps College  
Claremont, CA

Katherine King, Member  
Tri-County Watchdogs  
Frazier Park, CA 93222

Parin Shah  
Asian Pacific Environmental Network (APEN)  
Oakland, CA

John X Mataka, President  
Grayson Neighborhood Council

Donna Charpied,  
Desert Protection Society  
Desert Center Ca 92239

Liza Tucker  
Consumer Advocate  
Consumer Watchdog  
Los Angeles, CA

Doelorez Mejia  
Eastside Coalition Against Exide Toxic Technologies

Janice Schroeder  
Core member  
West Berkeley Alliance for Clean Air and Safe Jobs  
Berkeley, CA 94702

Denny Larson  
Community Science Center  
Richmond, CA

Thomas Helme, Coordinator  
California Environmental Justice Coalition

Bianca Lopez, Chairperson  
Valley Improvement Projects  
Modesto, CA

Marylia Kelley  
Executive Director,  
Tri-Valley CAREs (Communities Against a Radioactive Environment)  
Livermore, CA 94550

Lauren Ornelas, Founder/Executive Director  
Food Empowerment Project  
Cotati, CA 94931

Ms. Margaret Gordon  
West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project (WOEIP)  
Oakland, CA

Miguel Robles, Founder and Project Director  
Biosafety Alliance  
Coordinator of the Soil Not Oil Coalition.

Courtney Gonzales, Program Manager  
Community Food and Justice Coalition  
Oakland, CA

Colin Bailey, J.D., Executive Director  
The Environmental Justice Coalition for Water  
Sacramento, CA 95818-8911

Tameeka Bennett, Exec. Director  
Youth United for Community Action  
East Palo Alto, Ca

Michael Gomez Daly  
Political Director  
PowerPAC.org

Tony Bautista  
Director of Community Programming,  
CALO YouthBuild